

SOUTH HAMS DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE



Minutes of a meeting of the South Hams Development Management Committee held on Wednesday, 6th November, 2019 at 11.00 am at the Council Chamber - Follaton House

Present: **Councillors:**

Chairman Cllr Brazil
Vice Chairman Cllr Foss

Cllr Brown
Cllr Abbott
Cllr Long
Cllr Pringle

Cllr Holway
Cllr Kemp
Cllr Pannell
Cllr Taylor

In attendance:

Councillors:

Cllr Baldry
Cllr Pearce

Cllr Bastone

Officers:

Head of Development Management Practice
Planning Senior Specialist
Planning Specialists
Deputy Monitoring Officer
Specialist -Strategic Planning
Specialist – Democratic Services

33. Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 9 October 2019 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

34. Declarations of Interest

Members and officers were invited to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered and the following were made:

Cllrs T Holway declared a personal interest in application **3460/17/OPA**: READVERTISEMENT (Revised Plans Received) Outline application with some matters reserved for 7 self-build/custom build dwellings (five open market and two affordable self-build plots), by virtue of knowing the applicant and the neighbours. He remained in the meeting and took part in the vote thereon;

Cllr J Brazil declared a personal interest on behalf of all Members of the Committee in application **2821/19/FUL**: New agricultural shed – Stanborough Farm, Moreleigh, by virtue of the applicant being a fellow Member of the Council. They remained in the meeting and took part in the debate and vote thereon.

35. **Public Participation**

The Chairman announced that a list of members of the public and town and parish council representatives, who had registered their wish to speak at the meeting, had been circulated.

36. **Planning Applications**

The Committee considered the details of the planning applications prepared by the Planning Case Officers as presented in the agenda papers, and considered also the comments of Town and Parish Councils together with other representations received, which were listed within the presented agenda reports, and **RESOLVED** that:

a) 3460/17/OPA Lutterburn Farm, Lutterburn Street, Ugborough Parish: Ugborough

Outline application with some matters reserved for 7 self build/custom build dwellings (five open market and 2 affordable self-build plots)

Case Officer Update: One late letter of representation from Under Town Residents Association stating that the applicant did not have consent to make alterations to their land

Speakers included: Objector – Mrs Joan Fletcher: Supporter – Mr Simon Baker: Parish Council representative – Cllr George Beable (statement read): Ward Member – Cllr Holway

Recommendation: Delegate to the HOP Lead Development Management in consultation with the Chairman to conditionally approve planning permission, subject to a section 106 legal obligation.

However, in the event that the Section 106 legal agreement remains unsigned six months after this resolution, that the application is reviewed by the HOP Lead Development Management, in consultation with the Chairman of the Committee, and if no progress is being made, delegated authority is given to the HOP Lead to refuse the application in the absence of an agreed s106 Agreement.

During discussion, the Ward Member advised that he was representing the views of the local residents who were concerned about flooding and, whilst the drainage engineers had advised that the proposed flood alleviation scheme was acceptable, the residents had to undergo the stress of waiting to see if the scheme would work. Other Members noted that the proposed conditions attached to the approval would require flood mitigation work to be undertaken prior to commencement of the development. Members discussed the more technical aspects of the flood mitigation measures. Some Members accepted that the proposal, having previously been approved, did not present reasons for refusal. On taking the vote however, a majority of Members did not vote to approve the application, although Members were not minded to refuse the application either and it was clear that further information in respect of the flood alleviation scheme would assist them in coming to a view.

Committee Decision: Deferral, for further information on if and when the flood alleviation scheme can be implemented and information on the depth of flood waters.

b) 3011/19/FUL The Shippen, Cowsberry Farm, Burraton Parish: Ermington

Demolition of existing barn following Class Q approval and construction of new dwelling

Case Officer Update: The case officer corrected two inaccuracies within the Principle of Development section of the report in that reference to three barns and a car port were incorrect.

Speakers included: Supporter – Mrs Amanda Burden: local Ward Member - Cllr Holway

Recommendation: Refusal

Committee Decision: Refusal

c) 2101/19/FUL Lantern Lodge Hotel, Grand View Road, Hope Cove Parish: South Huish

Demolition of hotel (14 guest bedrooms, 4 staff bedrooms, indoor swimming pool, lounge/bar/dining areas etc.) and construction of mixed use development of 9 serviced short term holiday let apartments (providing total of 16 bedrooms), 1 unit of managers accommodation and 5 residential apartments (resubmission of 2066/18/FUL)

Prior to the presentation on this application, the Chairman advised that a site inspection had been requested by one of the local Ward Members. It was **PROPOSED, SECONDED** and on being put to the vote declared **CARRIED**, that the application be deferred for a site inspection.

**d) 1676/19/HHO Summerleaze, Drake Road, Salcombe
Parish: Salcombe**

Householder application for proposed roof extension and alterations to front, side and rear (Resubmission of 2098/18/HHO)

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Objector – Mr Rob Wheeler: Supporter – Mr Murray Ross: Town Council representative – Cllr Mike Fice: Ward Members – Cllrs Long and Pearce

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

During discussion, concerns were raised over the impact of the proposal on the neighbouring property, Myrana. Members were also advised that the suggested Kilowatt per annum figures quoted for the solar panels on the neighbouring property differed significantly from the actual figures, and therefore there was a negative impact in terms of renewable energy and the development would not be sustainable. Having attended the site inspection, a number of Members had concerns over the design of the building, particularly the 'butterfly' roof, and noted that the proposal would be out of character with the existing street scene, contrary to policies within the Salcombe Neighbourhood Plan.

Committee Decision: Refusal

Reasons:

1. The proposal will result in overlooking and loss of sunlight and daylight to Myrana, resulting in a detrimental impact on amenity, contrary to the provisions of policy DEV1 (1) Protecting health and amenity of the Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan.

2. The proposal by reason of its design will result in the introduction of an incongruent feature within the townscape in the form of the butterfly roof and by reason of its scale, bulk, massing and forward projection will result in an overbearing impact on the surrounding townscape, contrary to the provisions of DEV10 (1) Delivering high quality housing and DEV20 (2 & 4) Place shaping and the quality of the built environment, DEV25 (2 and (8 i, ii, iii) Nationally protected landscapes of the Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan, policies SALCENV1 (a) and SALCB1 (1, 3a & b) of the Salcombe Neighbourhood Plan and the guidance of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) contained within, but not limited to, paragraphs 124-132, 170 and 172.
3. The proposal by reason of its design, scale, bulk, massing and forward projection will overshadow the neighbouring property, Myrana, resulting in a loss of solar gain to the building and shading of solar PV panels, without it having been demonstrated that such losses have been offset within the proposal contrary to the provisions of policy DEV32 (3 &4) Delivering low carbon development of the Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan.

e) 2556/19/FUL Land adjacent to Bowden Hill, Yealmpton Parish: Yealmpton

Proposed new single storey dwelling with internal double garage and associated landscaping

Case Officer Update: Additional condition should be included – to secure details of any retaining walls or structures prior to them being built.

Speakers included: Objector – Mr Ron Cole: Supporter – Mr Mark Evans: Parish Council representative – Cllr Alan Cooper: Ward Member – Cllr Baldry

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval

Conditions

Standard 3 year time limit

Development to be carried out in accordance with plans

Program of archaeological works to be undertaken (pre commencement)

Landscaping (in interests of visual amenity, ecology and neighbours)

Removal of PD rights

Drainage – foul sewerage

Drainage – surface water
Tamar EMS
Adherence with recommendations in ecologist report
Garage to be retained for motor vehicles
Materials
Low carbon to include details of air source heat pump
Unsuspected land contamination
Details of any retaining walls/structures prior to them being built

**f) 2821/19/FUL Stanborough Farm, Moreleigh
Parish: Halwell & Moreleigh**

New agricultural shed

Case Officer Update: None

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval

Conditions:

Time limit
Approved Plans
Materials
Drainage

37. Planning Appeals Update

Members noted the list of appeals as outlined in the presented agenda report.

The Head of Development Management provided further details on specific recent appeal decisions, and the Case Officer provided further detail of the dismissed appeal decision that was listed.

38. Planning Performance Indicators

Members noted the Performance Indicators as outlined in the presented agenda report.

The Head of Development Management responded to questions of clarity.

The Meeting concluded at 3.35 pm

Signed by:

Chairman

This page is intentionally left blank

Voting Analysis for Planning Applications – DM Committee 6 November 2019

Application No:	Site Address	Vote	Councillors who Voted Yes	Councillors who Voted No	Councillors who Voted Abstain	Absent
3460/17/OPA	Lutterburn Farm, Lutterburn Street, Ugborough	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Brazil, Pannell, Abbott and Foss (4)	Cllrs Kemp, Long, Brown, Holway and Pringle (5)	Cllr Taylor (1)	Cllrs Hodgson and Rowe (2)
3460/17/OPA	Lutterburn Farm, Lutterburn Street, Ugborough	Deferral	Cllrs Brazil, Pannell, Abbott, Foss, Kemp, Long, Brown, Holway, Pringle and Taylor (10)	(0)	(0)	Cllrs Hodgson and Rowe (2)
3011/19/FUL	The Shippen, Cowsberry Farm, Burraton	Refusal	Cllrs Brazil, Pannell, Foss, Kemp, Long, Pringle and Taylor (7)	Cllrs Holway, Abbott and Brown (3)	(0)	Cllrs Hodgson and Rowe (2)
2101/19/FUL	Lantern Lodge Hotel, Grand View Road, Hope Cove	Defer for site inspection	Cllrs Long, Pannell, Kemp and Brown (4)	Cllrs Brazil, Holway and Pringle (3)	Cllrs Abbott and Foss (2)	Cllrs Hodgson, Rowe and Taylor (3)
1676/19/HHO	Summerleaze, Drake Road, Salcombe	Refusal	Cllrs Holway, Foss, Abbott, Pannell, Long, Kemp, Pringle and Brown (8)	(0)	Cllr Brazil (1)	Cllrs Hodgson, Rowe and Taylor (3)
2556/19/FUL	Land adjacent to Bowden Hill, Yealmpton	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Brazil, Holway, Foss, Abbott, Pannell, Pringle and Brown (7)	Cllrs Long and Kemp (2)	(0)	Cllrs Hodgson, Rowe and Taylor (3)
2821/19/FUL	Stanborough Farm, Moreleigh	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Holway, Foss, Pannell, Abbott, Brown, Brazil, Kemp, Long and Pringle (9)	(0)	(0)	Cllrs Hodgson, Rowe and Taylor (3)

This page is intentionally left blank